

**The United Nation's Sustainable Development Goals as a Global Content Framework?**

Brad M. Maguth  
The University of Akron

Huiyong Yang  
Henan University, China

---

**Abstract:**

Existing research in global and social studies education has focused on methods, tools, and instruments to impart dispositions and skills for global learning, with little research pertaining to key global content knowledge. In this manuscript, the authors consider the use of the United Nation's Sustainable Development Goals as a prospective global content knowledge framework to impart global learning in social studies. Middle-grades Ancient World History content standards from two countries, China and the U.S., were reviewed to evaluate the degree of their alignment to the United Nations' Sustainable Development Goals, particularly Goal 5: Gender Equality. The authors found little direct content alignment between content presented in the SDG and the reviewed content standards. Implications of this research in the consideration of global content knowledge frameworks, as well as preparing learners to live up to the expectations of the Sustainable Development Goals, particularly Goal 5, in social studies are discussed.

**Key words:** Sustainable Development Goals, United Nations, global education, gender, content standards, China

---

**Introduction**

Like never before, globalization and technology have connected culturally diverse and geographically distant populations. People, investments, goods, research, and ideas can be immediately transported to nearly every corner of our planet. At the same time as global markets, mass migration, and other forces push people together, increasing counter forces like rising nationalism and populism can pull people and states apart. However, mounting global

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

issues like global climate change, conflict and war, migration, disease, international trade and investment, and nuclear proliferation can only be addressed through citizens collaborating across borders to take informed action. In an age confounded by the horrible yet real effects of man-made global climate change, the words of Desmond Tutu still ring true: “Never before in history have human beings been called on to act collectively in defense of the Earth.”

Policy makers and non-governmental organizations from around the world have initiated educational reforms aimed at preparing globally competent youth (Darling-Hammond & Bransford, 2005; Gaudelli, 2016; Longview Foundation, 2017). States continue to make progress in designing their global education reforms and agendas to help prepare educators and students for an increasingly multicultural and global future (Cochran-Smith & Villegas, 2015). In certain countries, reforms include providing youth with meaningful opportunities to learn about and with diverse, global populations in order to take actions that create a more peaceful, prosperous, and just planet (Maguth & Hilburn, 2015). Educational reforms have often sought to advance global learning in three traditional curricular areas: knowledge, skills, and dispositions (OECD, 2017). Below, we define these three variables:

- **Knowledge:** Refers to information such as concepts, vocabulary, and facts learners acquire and retain through their senses (reading, watching, listening, touching, testing, etc.). In many states, the key knowledge students should learn in school is identified in state content standards (e.g., What is the capital of Russia?).
- **Skills:** Refers to the ability of learners to put knowledge into practice in order to apply previous knowledge to specific situations. Skills are developed and honed through constant practice. In many states, key skills students should be able to perform are identified in state curricular standards (e.g., Why is Moscow the capital of Russia?).
- **Dispositions:** Refers to learners’ attitudes, values, beliefs, ethics, and commitments that shape the way in which they see the world. These dispositions may influence learner behavior, and how they perceive the world and its people (e.g., having a curiosity and drive to learn more about Russia).

Research in the area of global education has often refrained from referencing or listing specific global content knowledge for teachers to teach (or students to learn) in school. Instead, research has mostly prioritized methodologies, assessments, and policies that promote particular global dispositions and skills in the learning process. For instance, the Asia Society’s popular framework “Educating for Global Competence: Preparing Our Youth to Engage the World” authored by

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Veronica Boix Mansilla and Anthony Jackson (2011), designed to assist states and educational organizations to promote global competence, presents the following core competencies:

- Investigating the world beyond their immediate environment, framing significant problems and conducting well-crafted and age-appropriate research.
- Recognizing perspectives, others' and their own, articulating and explaining such perspectives thoughtfully and respectfully.
- Communicating ideas effectively with diverse audiences, bridging geographic, linguistic, ideological, and cultural barriers.
- Taking action to improve conditions, viewing themselves as players in the world and participating reflectively.

While these four competencies provide educators with important skill sets and dispositions to advance global learning among students, the popular framework and its associated competencies are void of referencing any specific content knowledge about the world, its people, or issues. For instance, what world problems and accompanying perspectives should students recognize and investigate? The prioritization of skills and dispositions over the listing of specific global content knowledge is apparent in many other curricular frameworks including the recently adopted "Global Competence Framework: Preparing Our Youth for an Inclusive and Sustainable World" (OECD, 2018). This particular framework, absent of any specific global content, targets four areas of global competence:

1. the capacity to examine issues and situations of local, global and cultural significance;
2. the capacity to understand and appreciate different perspectives and world views;
3. the ability to establish positive interactions with people of different national, ethnic, religious, social or cultural backgrounds or gender; and
4. the capacity and disposition to take constructive action toward sustainable development and collective well-being.

In the area of global education, authors have tended to defer the listing of specific global content knowledge to individual states. This is due to the difficulty of getting states to agree on what content knowledge should be imparted in schools, and the desire of many state agencies to prioritize national and local identities over global (Evans, 2004; Grossman, 2017). Even as states

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

make progress in promoting global learning in classrooms to prepare educators and students for an increasingly global future, Cochran-Smith and Villegas (2015) find that it has been done in a way that gives priority to individual national interests, goals, and traditions. Due to the difficulty of getting stakeholders across U.S. states (let alone different countries) to agree on what constitutes appropriate global content knowledge, there exists a “global content knowledge gap” in social studies and global education. This includes little consensus among global educators on what information students should be taught in relation to the world and its people and issues. However, this turf war over what content should be prioritized and made visible in the classroom is not new to the teaching of history and social studies. Evans (2004), in “Social Studies Wars: What Should we Teach the Children?”, describes how the history of the social studies consists of competing camps struggling at different times to either retain control of the social studies curriculum or influence its future direction.

While curricular reform efforts have sought to advance global learning in the areas of skills and dispositions, there has been little progress in identifying what constitutes appropriate deep global content knowledge. This global content knowledge gap is detrimental to teachers that are already underprepared and resourced to teach about the world, its people, and issues (Longview Foundation, 2008; Merryfield, 2002). Davies, Evans, and Reid (2006) found that of over 700 teachers in England who rated education for global citizenship as important on a survey, very few reported being confident in their ability to teach it. Underprepared teachers often find little assistance when turning to their state content standards in order to teach global content supported by global educators and researchers. Rapoport (2009) investigated U.S. state social studies standards and found that globalization was only referenced in 15 of the 50 different state standards. When the term was referenced, it was used as an economic concept (e.g., globalization of economy, business globalization, globalization of trade), which fails to account for the ways in which globalization has shaped culture, politics, and broader human activity. Rapoport’s research also finds that the term “global citizen” or “global citizenship” was referenced in only two different state standards. Thus, educators who are genuinely committed to advancing global content knowledge often find little support and clarity when turning to their state social studies standards (Klein, 2013; Rapoport, 2009).

With a limited consideration and listing of deep global content knowledge, educators are being asked to impart skills and dispositions without the building blocks necessary to do so. In order to put into practice valuable skills and associated dispositions aimed at improving our world, educators may benefit from a more thorough listing of global content knowledge that is aimed

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

at building a more sustainable future for our planet. Researchers, educators, and policy makers must consider what global content is most meaningful for students to know in order to strengthen our world's future.

### **Method**

Our central research questions are as follows:

1. In what ways does a proposed global content knowledge framework, namely, the United Nations' (UN) Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), align with reviewed content standards in two different countries (China and the United States)?
2. How does this analysis inform educators, researchers, and policy makers towards the development of global content knowledge frameworks? Additionally, in what ways would global content knowledge frameworks, serving alongside complimentary frameworks that focus on the acquisition of skills and dispositions, enhance, complicate, or contest the aims and goals of a global education?

Our sub-questions are as follows:

1. How do the reviewed Junior High School Chinese Ancient World History standards mediate and complicate gender equality (SDG # 5)?
2. How do the reviewed Grade 7 Ancient World History State of Ohio content standards (in the U.S.) mediate and complicate gender equality (SDG # 5)?

This study is based on an analysis of official state-approved Junior High School ancient world history content standards in the People's Republic of China and in one large Midwestern U.S. state, Ohio. In China, the government has issued a required content framework and outline that informs the construction of textbooks and teacher instruction in the nation's history classrooms. However, in the United States, all 50 states are free to develop their own studies content standards, and content differs significantly across state borders (Stern & Stern, 2011).

We decided to analyze these curricular standards to better understand what curricular content is prioritized and the positionality and representation of content. Reviews of standards also allowed us to gain knowledge of the history and social studies curriculum in those countries. In our review of content standards from the two countries, we specifically looked at the alignment of presented curricular content in relation to the UN's SDG #5: Gender Equality. Data analysis was performed in order to identify common themes and to generate findings for our research

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

questions. A developed analytical tool, available in the appendix, helped chart the relationship of reviewed content standards to our proposed global content knowledge framework (the SDGs). This tool, in table format, listed applicable SDGs (inclusive of goals and targets) and any relationship to reviewed content standards. The format of the analytical tool was consistent for each set of standards reviewed.

We conducted our analysis in four steps. First, we collected, identified, and translated (if applicable) Junior High ancient world history content standards. These items were reviewed individually by the authors, as it pertained to the goals and targets of SGD #5: Gender Equality, across governmental documents for each country. Second, for each country, themes that emerged during our investigation from steps one and two were analyzed, with a particular focus on commonalities and differences. At the end of this process, we had a document that identified key curricular content in each country and its relation to our considered global content knowledge framework, namely, the SDGs (Goal #5). Finally, themes across countries were analyzed, with a particular focus on painting a more holistic picture as to ways in which curricular content in these two countries related to our proposed global content knowledge framework.

#### **Proposing Global Content Knowledge Framework: UN SDGs**

As educators and policy makers look for resources in order to fill a “global content knowledge gap,” we propose the inclusion of the United Nations’ Sustainable Development Goals (2015) for consideration. As of January 1, 2016, the 17 SDGs and their 169 targets, which were voted on and adopted by world leaders at the United Nations in 2015, are official. Until 2030, countries will mobilize their efforts to end all forms of poverty, fight inequalities, and tackle climate change. The SDGs, also known as Global Goals, build on the success of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and aim to go further to end all forms of poverty. According to the United Nations (2015) website,

The new Goals are unique in that they call for action by all countries, poor, rich and middle-income to promote prosperity while protecting the planet. They recognize that ending poverty must go hand-in-hand with strategies that build economic growth and addresses a range of social needs including education, health, social protection, and job opportunities, while tackling climate change and environmental protections. While the SDGs are not legally binding, governments are expected to take ownership and establish national frameworks for the achievement of the 17 Goals.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---



Figure 1: United Nations Sustainable Development Goals

The SDGs represent a signed agreement by 193 UN member states that identifies the most significant global issues, and commits all member states and their people to take immediate action to confront these challenges. These goals and their associated targets have emerged as the closest the world has to an agreed-upon listing of key concepts, vocabulary, facts, and figures that citizens around the world should understand and take action on.

### **Global Content Knowledge: Representations of SDG Content in China and U.S. Standards**

One way to analyze which global content knowledge individual nation-states prioritize and value is to analyze state-specific content standards in history and social studies. These materials often paint a picture of the overall content states want learners to know and value (Beltramo & Duncheon, 2013). In the following sections, the authors review findings in two different countries, China and the U.S. (State of Ohio), to analyze the curricular standards alignment to global content within one of the UN's SDGs. A wide analysis of how curricular content standards in each country aligns to all 17 SDGs and their targets is outside of the scope of this particular study, so the authors instead opted to investigate how curricular content best aligned to one of the 17 goals and its accompanying targets. We hope that future research will provide a more robust analysis of how states are aligning their curriculum to meet their nation's obligations

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

under the SDGs. Below, additional information is provided on the goals selected for review in our analysis for each country.

### **Why China's Curricular Standards and Gender Equality?**

The People's Republic of China content standards were selected due to Author #2 living and working as a college lecturer in the teaching of English in China, and Author #1 having two months of experience teaching and researching global learning in China. Furthermore, China has one of the largest populations of youth, more than 100 million children, enrolled in some 200,000 elementary schools and 52,600 junior high schools nationwide (Michael & Gu, 2016). Additionally, China's Ministry of Education provides readily accessible curricular resources and materials online.

The authors decided to select, out of all the other goals, SDG #5: Gender Equality for their analysis because of the popularity this topic has received domestically and internationally, and because of the paramount importance to ensure that all the world's citizens have full and equal access to rights and opportunities. SDG #5 is focused on promoting gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls; targets include eliminating violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual exploitation, ensuring women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life, and enacting legal frameworks to counter deeply rooted gender-based discrimination that often results from patriarchal attitudes and related social norms (United Nations, 2015).

### **China: Junior High School Course Standards in History**

For this study, we examined the *Junior High School Course Standards in History* (2011) published and endorsed by the Ministry of Education in the People's Republic of China. It must be noted that our focus was on the junior secondary grades (ages 12-15) and only in the area of Chinese Ancient World History. We selected these grades due to this being the point at which most students leave school, as compulsory education ends following the completion of grade nine (Zong, 2017).

The *Junior High School Course Standards in History* serves as the official curriculum guide to the teaching and learning of history in China (Zong, 2017). In particular, these standards outline general content that shape the development of history textbooks and instruction. While this document shapes curriculum and content that instructors must teach, schools can select from

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

textbooks approved by the State Textbooks Examination and Approval Committee (Zong, 2017). This committee is responsible for ensuring that approved textbooks present appropriate ideological perspectives and content that are in line with the minimum recommendations listed in state course standards and which are developmentally appropriate and adaptable in the classroom.

Table 1

*Junior High School Course Standards in China*

Chinese Ancient History Standards	<a href="http://old.pep.com.cn/peixun/xkpx/czls/kbjd/jiedu/201403/t20140320_1188557.htm">http://old.pep.com.cn/peixun/xkpx/czls/kbjd/jiedu/201403/t20140320_1188557.htm</a>
-----------------------------------	---

**U.S. Curricular Standards: Ohio's 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Ancient World History Standards**

For this study, we examined the 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Ancient World History Standards embedded within *Ohio's Learning Standards in Social Studies* approved and adopted by the State Board of Education of the State of Ohio (2010). The 7<sup>th</sup> grade content standards were selected due to course content (i.e., Ancient World History) and learner age (age 12) aligning well across the different countries' sets of standards. Seventh grade Ancient World History is the last world history course students complete in Ohio before transitioning into modern world history and contemporary American history. Ohio's social studies standards were selected due to both authors' familiarity with the standards, and Author #1 having over 15 years of social studies experience in Ohio.

*Ohio's Learning Standards in Social Studies* outlines the "most essential curricular content" inclusive of topics and content Ohio's social studies educators are expected to impart to learners. Educators are expected to align their classroom instruction and accompanying assessments in accord with these adopted state standards. However, there is no state assessment aligned to these standards, as the state has defunded all elementary and middle school social studies standardized assessments (Ohio Department of Education, 2017). Ohio law also makes it illegal for the state's department of education to require high school students to complete a world history assessment (Ohio Revised Code 3313.603).

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Table 2

*Ohio 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Social Studies Standards*

Grade 7: Ancient World History	<a href="http://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Model-Curriculum-for-Social-Studies/Grade-7-Social-Studies-Model-Curriculum_Aug2014.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US">http://education.ohio.gov/getattachment/Topics/Learning-in-Ohio/Social-Studies/Model-Curriculum-for-Social-Studies/Grade-7-Social-Studies-Model-Curriculum_Aug2014.pdf.aspx?lang=en-US</a>
--------------------------------	---

## Findings

Our review of the *Junior High Chinese Ancient World History* content standards and Ohio's 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Learning Standards in Ancient World History shows that there is inadequate alignment with Goal 5 of the United Nations' SDGs. Content standards represent essential knowledge, skills, and dispositions valued and officially promoted by their ministries of education. According to these documents, teachers are at best encouraged to take a "gender blind" instructional approach despite existing gender inequalities, historically and currently, both domestically and globally.

This study finds that no language expressed in SDG Goal #5 or its accompanying targets are included in either the Junior High Chinese Ancient World History or Ohio's 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Ancient World History content standards. Missing language includes referencing both historic and current efforts, domestically and internationally, in ending all forms of discrimination and violence against women and girls, efforts to ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life, and the adopting and strengthening of sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels.

Of the 31 historical individuals represented in the Chinese Ancient World History Standards, 30 are male. The only woman represented is Princess Wencheng; her claim to fame highlights how her marriage created "harmony" between the Tibet and Tang Dynasty. It must be noted that all of the males referenced in the document were scientists, inventors, soldiers, and esteemed statesmen.

While females and their contributions to society are mostly absent in the Chinese Ancient World History Standards, there is also a failure to reference any historical improvements (through movements or decree) or any historical progression or struggle in the area of gender equality. No

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

references are made to patriarchy and patrilineal societies that existed from at least the 11<sup>th</sup> century BCE onward in China. This includes the popularity of foot binding, female infanticide, and restricting the freedom of movement for women. The silence and invisibility of contributions by women in Chinese ancient history is contrary to the rich historical record of the important role women played in their communities and families during this time (Brown, 2018; Cartwright, 2017).

The 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Ohio Ancient World History Content Standards also fail to reference gender or any historical improvements (through movements or decree), progression, or struggle in the area of gender equality. While no historical individuals were referenced in the very vague content statements or topics sections, the accompanying model curriculum document does present historical figures and specific gendered content to be communicated by instructors. These include:

- When discussing Greek Democracy and the Roman Republic (Content Statement 17), the document informs teachers that only males over 18 with Athenian fathers could be granted citizenship and given the right to vote in elections. The document never states directly that women were unable to vote, masking this inequality in the fact that other males (those under 18 and without an Athenian father) were unable to be citizens and vote as well.
- This same model curriculum document, under its “content elaborations” section, lists three historically significant actors by name: Christopher Columbus, Marco Polo, and Kings [in general]. No historically important females or female-specific titles (i.e. Queen or Princess) are referenced.
- Missing from Ohio’s 7<sup>th</sup> Grade World History standards is any reference to the discrimination and challenges faced by girls and women throughout ancient world history, and the persistent struggle for females to gain acceptance and entry into circles outside family and leadership roles. Women and their contributions are invisible in the Ohio ancient world history standards, more so than even individual female representation in reviewed Chinese ancient history standards.

This missing content across both sets of standards only reinforces the still long and difficult work needed in schools to advance gender equality. As noted within the United Nations’ SDGs:

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Achieving gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls will require more vigorous efforts, including legal frameworks, to counter deeply rooted gender-based discrimination that often results from patriarchal attitudes and related social norms. Content standards in history are one such necessary legal framework that can be revisited to more vigorously counter discrimination and advance gender equality.

Using the SDGs as one possible marker for global content knowledge could easily serve as an analytical tool to investigate the commitment (or lack thereof) states are making in using schools to prepare citizens to confront significant global issues and challenges. After all, the SDGs represent an agreement by 193 UN member states that identifies the most significant global issues, committing all member states and their people to working together to tackle these challenges. Current frameworks in global education are often void of referencing any specific global content knowledge about the world, its people, or issues, and this research explored the possibility of using the SDGs as a common entry point in presenting global content to learners.

This study finds little to no direct content alignment between the SDGs and the reviewed state content standards. This lack of alignment may pose a challenge for some states in agreeing upon a global content knowledge framework, even with the SDGs as a prospective pathway. Content standards frequently promote national identities and allegiances that come at the cost of and trump readying all youth for an increasingly global age (Grossman, 2017; Ross, 2004).

### **Discussion**

There is recent textbook analysis research that finds improvements in documenting the historical contributions of women in China (Zong, 2017) and in the U.S. (Chick, 2006; Chick & Corle, 2016). Zong investigated the six most widely adopted middle school history textbooks and reported an increase in the visual and textual reference to women in middle school history textbooks. This includes 45 textual references to women and 41 visual images of women across the six middle school history textbooks she analyzed. Unfortunately, Zong's research did not report how women's representation and inclusion compared to that of men. She did note, however, that women are still omitted from these texts during key historical Chinese events (May Fourth Movement, Revolutionary Era, etc.). Gender stereotyping and misrepresentation seemed to dominate history textbooks up through the 1990s (Shi & Ross, 2002; Yi, 2002). Yi Jin's research (2002), which investigated widely adopted history textbooks in China in the 1990s, found the gendered division of labor and gender role clearly manifested in young children's reading materials. Yi noted that:

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

One hundred percent of scientists, workers, peasants, and soldiers are males, whereas 100 percent of teachers and 75 percent of service personnel are female. Males that appear in elementary school language teaching materials pursue social, professional, managerial, and recreational pursuits, whereas females appear mainly in private, family settings. Even prominent female leaders who have shaped the course of Chinese history are depicted in domestic or supportive roles. Deng Yingchao, one of the most influential female leaders of the Chinese Communist Party and state, appears twice in elementary school teaching materials, once mending Premier Zhou Enlai's clothes, and once bringing an umbrella to a guard on a rainy day. (p. 68)

Historical narratives and research are filled with powerful men writing about the importance of other powerful men, and *his*-story has taken precedent over *her*-story in the social studies classroom (Crocco, 2011). In particular, ancient China was a patriarchy where women were expected to follow the "three obediences" (Cheng, 2016). An ancient Chinese woman was expected to obey her father before she married, her husband after marriage, and her son after her husband's death. Ancient Chinese men also valued particular "virtues" in women. These virtues included women being loyal and moral (fidelity) to the men in her life, and their being ignorant, passive, and uneducated, as women in ancient China were not allowed to attend formal schooling (Cheng, 2016). These unjust and discriminatory attitudes go unacknowledged in the Junior High Chinese Ancient World History Standards, as do the valuable, rich historical contributions of such female figures as:

- Empress Zhangsun (601-636 CE), one of the most famous women in ancient Chinese history. She was wife to Emperor Li Shimin (598-649 CE) during his reign from 626-649 and assisted in the founding of the Tang dynasty (618-907). She also wrote a 30-volume work titled *Examples for Women*. When, upon her death in 636, Emperor Taizong was presented with her writings, he said, "This book, written by the Empress, is capable of being an example to generations;"
- Li Qingzhao (born 1084, died after 1155), one of China's greatest poets. She produced seven volumes of essays and six volumes of poetry, but most of her work is lost except for some poetry fragments. Her work continues to be highly regarded;
- Emperor Wu Zetian, also known as Empress Consort Wu (624-705 CE), the only female emperor in the history of China. She reigned during the Tang Dynasty (618-907 CE) and was one of the most effective and controversial monarchs in China's history. When her

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

husband Emperor Gaozong died in 683, Wu took control of the government as ruling emperor of China until a year before her death in 705 at the age of 81.

Chick and Corle (2016) analyzed gender balance in the texts and illustrations of three recently published high school U.S. history textbooks and one alternate volume of American history. In all of the American history texts analyzed, there were significantly more males than females in textbook content and illustrations. Women and girls who contributed to U.S. history were absent, leaving teachers in a difficult position whereby they needed to fill the visibility gender gap through their own research and sources. This finding was also visible in our analysis of the Ohio 7<sup>th</sup> Grade Ancient World History Standards, as the names and actions of females that contributed to world history went unacknowledged and reordered. This, despite an array of vast female actors in ancient history (including those listed previously) who helped shape the world (Brown, 2018), such as:

- Cleopatra (Cleopatra VII), who ruled ancient Egypt for almost three decades. She could speak various languages and served as a dominant ruler who gained influence over Roman leaders Julius Caesar and Mark Antony, some of the most powerful Western men of the time;
- Artemisia, Warrior-Queen of Halicarnassus, the ruler of Halicarnassus (near today's Bodrum, Turkey) and its neighboring islands, part of the Persian empire then ruled by Xerxes. When Xerxes went to war against Greece (480-479 BCE), Artemisia brought five ships and helped Xerxes fight the Greeks in the naval battle of Salamis. The Greeks offered a reward of 10,000 drachmas for capturing the courageous Artemisia, but no one succeeded in winning the prize;
- Enheduanna, an Akkadian/Sumerian poet credited with creating the paradigms of poetry, psalms, and prayers used throughout the ancient world, which led to the development of the genres recognized in the present day.

This research is coupled with findings that textbooks in the U.S. and China are emerging as more gender inclusive despite a lack of attention to gender equality in middle grades ancient world history standards. It is our conclusion that, at best, both sets of standards reviewed strive to take a “gender blind” approach, and authors opted to take a mostly collective “we” approach versus disaggregating historical events, issues, achievements by gender. However, when specific individuals are referenced in these standards and within their supporting documents, all tend to be male figures.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Furthermore, this study found that there is little to no direct content alignment between SDG #5: Gender Equality and the reviewed state content standards. Thus, as currently written, the goals do not align to or fill a “global content knowledge gap” in global education. This supports the finding that curricular content continues to prioritize national and local identities over global issues or shared goals (Grossman, 2017; Ross, 2005). A different yet related challenge in the movement towards a global content knowledge framework is the process of deciding what content to include in schools, as this process can be difficult and contentious across and within nation-states. Even though the United Nations’ 17 SDGs and 169 targets provides an agreed-upon global agenda to promote a sustainable future for humanity, their intended purpose was not to serve as a resource for states in identifying global content in their school’s curriculum standards, as valuable as this may be. The SDGs are general, agreed-upon statements, with some content listed within devised targets that fail to provide a thorough list of global content knowledge about the world, its people, or issues.

Finally, and of paramount importance, a global content knowledge framework includes the limitations that would exist in any construction of an agreed-upon framework. This includes how such a framework may marginalize or subordinate minority perspectives. Such a framework may serve as an ideological tool that colonizes the hearts and minds of others—something all too common in the history of curriculum, schooling, and global learning (Merryfield, 2008; Subedi, 2010; Willinsky, 1998). Individual nation-states are closest to the needs of their citizens and, many would argue, best positioned to meet their particular development needs.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

**References**

- Beltramon, J. L., & Duncheon, J. C. (2013). Globalization standards: A comparison of U.S. and non-U.S. social studies curricula. *The Journal of Social Studies Research, 37*, 97-109.
- Brown, E. L., & Zong, G. (2017). *Global perspectives on gender and sexuality in education: Raising awareness, fostering equity, advancing justice*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Press.
- Benavot, A., & Jere, C. (2016, March 8). *Gender bias is rife in textbooks*. World Education Blog. Retrieved at <https://gemreportunesco.wordpress.com/2016/03/08/gender-bias-is-rife-in-textbooks>
- Boix Mansilla, V., & Jackson, A. (2011). *Educating for global competence: Preparing our youth to engage the world*. Asia Society. Retrieved at <https://asiasociety.org/files/book-globalcompetence.pdf>
- Cartwright, M. (2017). *Women in ancient China*. Ancient History Encyclopedia. Retrieved at <https://www.ancient.eu/article/1136/women-in-ancient-china>
- Chen, Q. (2010). Curricular reform and the writing of high school history textbooks in China. *Social Education, 74*(1), 42-44.
- Cheng, L. (2016). *Berkshire encyclopedia of China*. Great Barrington, MA: Berkshire Publishing Group.
- Chick, K. (2006). Gender balance in K-12 American history textbooks. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 1*(3), 284-290.
- Chick, K., & Corle, S. (2016). Confronting gender imbalance in high school history textbooks through the C3 framework. *Social Studies Research and Practice, 11*(2), 1-16.
- Cochran-Smith, M., & Villegas, A. M. (2015). Preparing teachers for diversity and high poverty schools: A research-based perspective. In J. Lampert & B. Burnett (Eds.), *Teacher education for high poverty schools*. New York, NY: Springer Press.
- Crocco, M. S. (2011). Teaching about women in world history. *The Social Studies, 102*, 18-24.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Darling-Hammond, L., & Bransford, J. (Eds.). (2005). *Preparing teachers for a changing world: What teachers should learn and be able to do*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Davies, I., Evans, M., & Reid, A. (2005). Globalizing citizenship education? A critique of "global education" and "citizenship education." *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 53(1), 66-89.

Gaudelli, W. (2016). *Global citizenship education: Everyday transcendence*. New York: Routledge.

Grossman, D. (2017). Global education. In M. M. Manfra & C. M. Bolick (Eds.), *The Wiley Handbook of Social Studies Research* (pp. 518-568). West Sussex, UK: John Wiley Sons.

Guo, N. (2003). Analysis of representations of Wu Ze Tian in junior secondary history textbooks. *Chinese Education and Society*, 36(3), 12-15.

Kahn, J. (2006, September 1). Where is Mao? Chinese revise history books. *New York Times*. Retrieved at <http://www.nytimes.com/2006/09/01/world/asia/01china.html>

Klein, J. D. (2013). Making meaning in a standards-based world: Negotiating tensions in global education. *Educational Forum*, 77(4), 481-490.

Lin, L., Zhao, Y., Ogawa, M., Hoge, J., & Kim, B. Y. (2009). Whose history? An analysis of the Korean war in history textbooks from the United States, South Korea, Japan, and China. *The Social Studies*, 100(5), 222-232.

Longview Foundation. (2017). *Connecting students and teachers to the world*. Retrieved at <https://longviewfdn.org>

Longview Foundation. (2008). Teacher preparation for the global age: The imperative for change. Retrieved at <http://www.acenet.edu/news-room/Documents/Teacher-Prep-for-Global-Age.pdf>

Ma, J. (2001). A cursory analysis of the factors in secondary school history courses that are disadvantageous. *Chinese Education & Society*, 31(3), 64-71.

Maguth, B., & Hilburn, H. (2015). *The state of global education: Learning with the world and its people*. New York, NY: Routledge Press.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Merryfield, M. (2008). Worldmindedness: Taking the blinders off. *Journal of Curriculum and Instruction*, 2(1), 6-20.

Merryfield, M. (2000). Why aren't teachers being prepared to teach for diversity, equity, and global interconnectedness? A study of lived experiences in the making of multicultural and global educators. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 16(4), 429-443.

Michael, R., & Gu, M. (2016, March 7). *Education in China*. World Education News and Reviews. Accessed at <http://wenr.wes.org/2016/03/education-in-china-2>

Ministry of Education of the People's Republic of China. (2011). *Junior high school history standards*. Retrieved from <http://old.pep.com.cn/peixun/xkpx/czls>

Ohio Department of Education. (2017). *State social studies tests for grades 4 and 6 eliminated*. Retrieved at <http://education.ohio.gov/Media/Ed-Connection/July-17-2017/State-social-studies-tests-for-grades-4-and-6-elim>

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development [OECD]. (2018). *Preparing our youth for an inclusive and sustainable world: OECD & PISA global competence framework*. Retrieved at <http://www.oecd.org/pisa/Handbook-PISA-2018-Global-Competence.pdf>

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development [OECD]. (2017). *Global competency for an inclusive world*. Retrieved at <https://www.oecd.org/education/Global-competency-for-an-inclusive-world.pdf>

Rapoport, A. (2009). A forgotten concept: Global citizenship education and state social studies standards. *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, 33(1), 91-112.

Ross, E. W. (2005). *The social studies wars: What should we teach the children?* New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Shi, J., & Ross, H. (2002). Guest editor's introduction. *Chinese Education & Society*, 35(5), 3.

Subedi, B. (2010). *Critical global perspectives: Rethinking knowledge about global societies*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Press.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Stern, S. M., & Stern, J. (2011). *The state of state U.S. history standards, 2011*. Thomas Fordham Institute. Retrieved at [http://edex.s3-us-west-2.amazonaws.com/publication/pdfs/SOSS\\_History\\_FINAL\\_7.pdf](http://edex.s3-us-west-2.amazonaws.com/publication/pdfs/SOSS_History_FINAL_7.pdf)

United Nations. (2015). *Sustainable development goals*. Retrieved at <http://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals>

Willinsky, J. (1998). *Learning to divide the world: Education at empire's end*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minneapolis Press.

Yi, J. 2002. A discussion on the form of elementary school social teaching materials from the angle of gender analysis. *Chinese Education and Society*, 35(5), 63-76.

Zong, G. (2017). A content analysis of representations of Chinese middle school history textbooks. In E. L. Brown & G. Zong (Eds.), *Global perspectives on gender and sexuality in education: Raising awareness, fostering equity, advancing justice* (pp. 129-146). Charlotte, NC: Information Age Press.

---

**About the Authors:**

**Brad Maguth** - Associate Professor of Social Studies Education in the Department of Curricular & Instructional Studies in the LeBron James Family Foundation College of Education, The University of Akron.

**Huiyong Yang** - Instructor of English in the Department of English at Henan University, China.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Appendix A - Analytical Tool

SDG Target #	Target	Content Review	
		<i>Standard Title</i>	<i>Applicable Content Standard</i>
5.1	End all forms of discrimination against all women and girls everywhere		
5.2	Eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual and other types of exploitation		
5.3	Eliminate all harmful practices, such as child, early and forced marriage and female genital mutilation		
5.4	Recognize and value unpaid care and domestic work through the		

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

	provision of public services, infrastructure and social protection policies and the promotion of shared responsibility within the household and the family as nationally appropriate		
5.5	Ensure women's full and effective participation and equal opportunities for leadership at all levels of decision-making in political, economic and public life		
5.6	Ensure universal access to sexual and reproductive health and reproductive rights as agreed in accordance with the Programme of Action of the International Conference on		

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

	Population and Development and the Beijing Platform for Action and the outcome documents of their review conferences		
5.A	Undertake reforms to give women equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to ownership and control over land and other forms of property, financial services, inheritance and natural resources, in accordance with national laws		
5.B	Enhance the use of enabling technology, in particular information and communications technology, to promote the empowerment of women		

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

5.C	Adopt and strengthen sound policies and enforceable legislation for the promotion of gender equality and the empowerment of all women and girls at all levels		
	Other: Gender inequality persists worldwide, depriving women and girls of their basic rights and opportunities. Achieving gender equality and the empowerment of women and girls will require more vigorous efforts, including legal frameworks, to counter deeply rooted gender-based discrimination that often results from patriarchal attitudes and related social norms.		

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

Appendix B - Historic Individuals References, Chinese Ancient History (Grades 7-9)

Male or Female	Historical Individuals Referenced w/ Content
M	○ Emperor Shi Huangdi was the founder of the Qin Dynasty and was the first emperor of a unified China.
M	○ Emperor Wudi was a great emperor in the Han Dynasty and his empire was the largest one in the world at that time.
M	○ Zheng He was a Chinese mariner, explorer, diplomat, fleet admiral, and court eunuch during China's early Ming Dynasty.
M	○ Emperor Yan, the Flame Emperor, was a legendary ancient Chinese ruler in pre-dynastic times.
M	○ Emperor Huang, the Emperor Yellow, was a legendary ancient Chinese ruler in pre-dynastic times. The Chinese people are often referred as the “Descendants of the Yan and Huang.”
M	○ Shang Yang was a politician in Qin Dynasty and is known for The Reforms of Shang Yang.
M	○ Laozi was an ancient Chinese philosopher and writer. He is known as the reputed author of the Tao Te Ching, the founder of philosophical Taoism.
M	○ Confucius was an influential Chinese teacher, editor, politician, and philosopher.
M	○ Chen Sheng was the leader of the Dazexiang Uprising, the first rebellion against the Qin Dynasty.
M	○ Wu Guang was a leader of the first rebellion against the Qin Dynasty.

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Emperor Wendi was an emperor in the Han Dynasty who ruled his empire with “virtues.”</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Emperor Jingdi was the son of Emperor Wendi and maintained the peace and prosperity of the Han Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Sima Qian was a Chinese historian of the Han dynasty. He is considered the father of Chinese historiography for his Records of the Grand Historian.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Zhang Zhongjing was an Eastern Han Dynasty physician and one of the most eminent Chinese physicians during the later years of the Han Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Hua Tuo was an ancient Chinese physician who lived in the late Eastern Han Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Emperor Xiao Wendi was an emperor in the Northern Wei Dynasty and advocated the integration of different ethics.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Zu Chongzhi was a famous mathematician and astronomer in the Southern and Northern Dynasty period.</li></ul>
F	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Princess Wencheng was a princess of the royal family in the Tang Dynasty and married the leader of Tufan (today’s Tibet) to promote ethnic integration.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Emperor Xuanzong of Tang was the seventh emperor of the Tang dynasty in China, reigning from 713 to 756 CE.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Jian Zhen was a monk in the Tang Dynasty who went to Dong Ying (today’s Japan) to spread Buddhism.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Xuan Zang was a monk in the Tang Dynasty who went to Tian Zhu (today’s India) to learn Buddhism.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Emperor Taizong of Tang was the second emperor of the Tang dynasty of China, ruling from 626 to 649 CE.</li></ul>

---

Corresponding author: [bmaguth@uakron.edu](mailto:bmaguth@uakron.edu)

©2012/2023 National Council for Social Studies International Assembly

<http://www.iajiss.org> ISSN: 2327-3585

---

M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ An Lushan was a leader of Fanzhen (local separate regime) who led a rebellion against the Tang Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Shi Siming was a leader of Fanzhen who helped An Lushan in the rebellion.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Yue Fei was a Chinese military general who defended the Southern Song Dynasty against foreign invasion.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Genghis Khan was the Great Khan and founder of the Mongol Empire, which became the largest contiguous empire in history after his death. He came to power by uniting many of the nomadic tribes of Northeast Asia.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Qi Jiguang was a military general of the Ming Dynasty. He is best known for leading the defense on the coastal regions against wokou (Japanese pirates) activities in the 16th century.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Li Zicheng was a Chinese rebel leader who overthrew the Ming Dynasty in 1644 and ruled over China briefly as the emperor of the short-lived Shun Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Zheng Chenggong was a Chinese Ming loyalist who resisted the Qing conquest of China and recovered Taiwan.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Wen Tianxiang was a politician and patriotic poet in the Song Dynasty who is known for his fighting against the Yuan Dynasty.</li></ul>
M	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ Kang Xi was the fourth emperor in the Qing Dynasty and fought many wars to keep the territorial integrity of China.</li></ul>